

**GUD No. 9670  
(Consolidated Cases)**

---

**PETITION FOR DE NOVO REVIEW OF THE REDUCTION OF THE GAS UTILITY RATES OF ATMOS ENERGY CORP., MID - TEX DIVISION, BY THE CITIES OF ADDISON, BEDFORD, BENBROOK, ET AL.,**

**STATEMENT OF INTENT FILED BY ATMOS ENERGY CORP., MID - TEX DIVISION TO CHANGE RATES IN THE COMPANY'S STATEWIDE GAS UTILITY SYSTEM, AND**

**PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ATMOS ENERGY CORPORATION FROM THE ACTIONS OF MUNICIPALITIES DENYING A RATE REQUEST**

---

**APPEARANCES:**

**FOR APPLICANT:**

**Gary D. Compton  
J. Alan Holman  
James W. Checkley, Jr.  
John K. Arnold  
Locke Liddell & Sapp LLP  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 300  
Austin, Texas 78701**

**FOR INTERVENORS:**

**John Pierce Griffin  
1701 N. Congress  
Austin, Texas 78711 - 2967**

**Staff, Railroad Commission of Texas**

**Larry C. Buch  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 12548, Capitol Station  
Austin, Texas 78711 - 2548**

**State of Texas**

**Geoffrey M. Gay  
Georgia N. Crump  
Lloyd Gosselink Blevins  
Rochelle & Townsend, P.C.  
111 Congress Avenue, Suite 1800  
Austin, Texas 78701  
P.O. Box 1148  
Austin, Texas 78767**

**Atmos Cities Steering Committee**

**Jim Boyle  
Herrera & Boyle, PLLC  
816 Congress Ave., Ste. 1120  
Austin, Texas 78701**

**Atmos Texas Municipalities**

**Dan Lawton  
The Lawton Law Firm  
1005 Congress Ave., Suite 1050  
Austin, Texas 78701**

**Thomas P. Perkins, Jr. City Attorney      City of Dallas  
Peter B. Haskel, Assistant City Attorney  
Don Knight, Assistant City Attorney**

**Norman J. Gordon  
Mounce, Green, Myers, Safi & Galatzan  
100 N. Stanton, Suite 1700  
El Paso, Texas 79901**

**Richard P. Noland  
James M. Bushee  
James Guy  
Southerland, Asbill & Brennan LLP  
701 Brazoss St. Suite 1040  
Austin, Texas 78701-2559**

**Paul F. Forshay  
Southerland, Asbill & Brennan LLP  
1275 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004-2415**

**John R. Hays Jr.  
807 Brazos Street, Ste 500  
Austin, Texas 78701**

Avner Wolanow  
Wash n Dry Coin Laundries  
2663 Freewood Drive  
Dallas, Texas 75220

**PROPOSAL FOR DECISION**

**PROCEDURAL HISTORY**

<b>HEARD BY:</b>	Gene Montes, Hearings Examiner Mark Evarts and Mark Brock, Technical Examiners
<b>RECORD CLOSED:</b>	February 2, 2007
<b>PFD CIRCULATION DATE:</b>	February 2, 2007

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	Page 1
II.	PROCEDURAL HISTORY AND NOTICE .....	Page 1
	A. Procedural History .....	
	B. Notice .....	Page 4
III.	JURISDICTION .....	Page 6
	A. Original .....	Page 6
	B. Appellate .....	Page 6
IV.	INTERVENING PARTIES AND PROTESTANTS .....	Page 6
V.	ISSUES ADDRESSED IN THE INTERIM ORDERS .....	Page 7
VI.	HEARING AND WITNESSES .....	Page 10

VII.	OVERVIEW OF ATMOS OF MERGER OF TXU AND ATMOS .....	Page 11
VIII	THE RELIABILITY OF THE BOOK AND RECORDS .....	Page 13
IX	SHARED SERVICES EXPENSES .....	Page 14
A.	Overview .....	Page 14
B.	Burden of Proof .....	Page 16
C.	Shared Services Expenses – Inappropriate expenses .....	Page 17
1.	Meals .....	Page 19
2.	Entertainment .....	Page 23
3.	Alcohol Expenses .....	Page 25
4.	Lodging .....	Page 27
5.	Transportation .....	Page 30
6.	Employee Welfare .....	Page 33
7.	Club Dues .....	Page 36
8.	Process for Capitalizing Expenses .....	Page 37
9.	Various proposed adjustments .....	Page 37
10.	Examiners’ Recommendation .....	Page 37
D.	Allocation of Common Costs and the Composite Allocation Factor .....	Page 39
1.	Overview .....	Page 39
2.	The Operations and Maintenance Component .....	Page 41
3.	Incorporating Operating Income .....	Page 41
4.	The Customer Component .....	Page 41
5.	Examiners’ Recommendation .....	Page 42
E.	Adjustment to Individual Cost Centers .....	Page 43
1.	Cost Center 1114 – Dallas Vice President and Controller .....	Page 43
2.	Cost Center 1116 – Taxation .....	Page 44

- 3. Cost Center 1129 — Income Tax ..... Page 44
- 4. Cost Center 1132 — Investor Relations ..... Page 45
- 5. Cost Center 1203 – Amarillo Waco Call Center ..... Page 46
- 6. Cost Center 1350 – Dallas Non-Utility Operations ..... Page 47
- 7. Cost Center 1904 – Dallas Supplemental Executive Benefit Plan Page 49
- 8. Cost Center 1905 – Outside Director Retirement Cost ..... Page 49
- 9. Cost Center 1908 – Dallas Supplemental Employee Benefits .... Page 50
- F. Adjustment to the allocation factors applied to the following cost centers: 1109, 1115, 1148, 1151, and 1200 ..... Page 51
  - 1. Cost Center 1109 - Dallas Payment Applications ..... Page 51
  - 2. Cost Center 1115 - Dallas Billing Services ..... Page 51
  - 3. Cost Center 1148 - Dallas Revenue Support ..... Page 51
  - 4. Cost Center 1151 - Accounting Director ..... Page 52
  - 5. Cost Center 1200 - Customer Revenue Collections ..... Page 52
- G. Payroll Adjustment ..... Page 52
- X. INTERIM RATE ADJUSTMENT ISSUES (GRIP) ..... Page 53
  - A. Interim Rate Adjustments: Overview of the Statute and Regulations ... Page 53
  - B. Overview of Interim Rate Adjustment Filings made by Atmos Mid-Tex . Page 56
  - C. Atmos Mid-Tex’s Eligibility to File Interim Rate Adjustments. .... Page 56
  - D. Infrastructure or Invested Capital ..... Page 59
  - E. Whether the Interim Rate Adjustment should be based upon Rate Base .. Page 60
  - F. Earning Monitoring Report ..... Page 61
  - G. Does the Ruling by the District Court Invalidate the Interim Rate Filing . Page 62
  - H. Poly I and the Interim Rate Adjustment, and the adjustment to Rate Base Page 62
    - 1. Introduction ..... Page 63

2.	The Legal Effect of the Final Order in GUD No. 9400 .....	Page 63
I.	Establishing that the Interim Rate Adjustment were Just and Reasonable	Page 67
1.	Documentary Support .....	Page 67
2.	Specific Projects .....	Page 70
3.	Overhead Loading - Evidence of Improper Accounting Practices	Page 72
a.	Introduction and Position of Parties .....	Page 72
b.	Discussion of Evidence and the Company's Response .....	Page 73
c.	Examiners Recommendation .....	Page 77
J.	Affiliate Transactions included in the Second Interim Rate Adjustment .	Page 80
K.	System Classification and Reclassification .....	Page 81
L.	Refund Calculation for Amounts Collected Pursuant to the Company's Interim Rate Adjustments .....	Page 82
XI.	RATE BASE .....	Page 82
A.	Adjustments to Accumulated Depreciation .....	Page 82
B.	Cash Working Capital .....	Page 83
1.	Introduction .....	Page 83
2.	Revenue Lag Days .....	Page 84
a.	Billing Lag .....	Page 85
b.	Collection Lag .....	Page 87
(1)	Method of Calculation .....	Page 88
(2)	Securitization or factoring of Receivables .....	Page 90
3.	Expense Lead Days .....	Page 91
a.	Pipeline Expense Lead Days .....	Page 91

- b. Other O&M: Labor Expenses ..... Page 93
      - c. Other O&M: Non-Labor Expenses ..... Page 94
        - (1) Categorization ..... Page 94
        - (2) Invoice #139: Prepayments ..... Page 95
      - d. Taxes Other than Income Taxes ..... Page 96
    - C. Review Pursuant to Section 102.051: ADFIT and ITC ..... Page 96
      - 1. Overview ..... Page 96
      - 2. The Public Interest Determination ..... Page 97
      - 3. Adjustment to disallow the effect of the transaction ..... Page 101
    - D. Computer Software included in Rate Base ..... Page 102
  - XII. EXPENSES ..... Page 103
    - A. Introduction ..... Page 103
    - B. Expenses ..... Page 104
      - 1. Labor - Merit Increases ..... Page 104
      - 2. Labor - Benefits ..... Page 105
      - 3. Labor - Marketing ..... Page 106
      - 4. Labor - Contract Labor Expenses ..... Page 108
      - 5. Labor - Meter Reading Expenses ..... Page 109
      - 6. Uncollectible - Expenses ..... Page 110
      - 7. Gas Technology Institute Expense ..... Page 112
      - 8. Odorant Expenses ..... Page 113
      - 9. Facilities Expenses ..... Page 115
      - 10. Bill Print Expense ..... Page 118
      - 11. Cost Savings from CapGemeni Savings and Savings Identified by

	Sungard .....	Page 119
12.	Ad Valerom Tax Expense .....	Page 119
13.	Affiliate Expenses: BlueFlame Issues .....	Page 120
14.	Computer Software Amortization .....	Page 122
15.	Depreciation .....	Page 123
	a. Shared Services .....	Page 123
	b. Mid - Tex Negative Salvage Value Adjustment .....	Page 126
	(1) Introduction .....	Page 126
	(2) Specific Objection to Calculation of Net Salvage ...	Page 127
	(3) Examiners Recommendation .....	Page 130
XIII.	CAPITAL STRUCTURE AND RATE OF RETURN .....	Page 132
	A. Introduction .....	Page 132
	B. Capital Structure .....	Page 133
	C. Cost of Equity .....	Page 135
	1. Introduction .....	Page 135
	2. Comparable Firms .....	Page 135
	3. DCF Analysis, CAPM Analysis and Other Economic Factors .....	Page 136
	D. Examiners Recommendation on Cost of Equity and Overall Return .....	Page 140
XIV.	BILLING DETERMINANTS .....	Page 143
	A. Total Consumption - Base Load Adjustment .....	Page 143
	B. Total Number of Bills - Customer Growth Adjustment .....	Page 144
	C. Weather Adjustment .....	Page 147
XV.	FUNCTIONALIZATION, CLASSIFICATION, and ALLOCATION .....	Page 148
	A. Introduction .....	Page 148



B.	Minimum System Analysis .....	Page 150
1.	Minimum System Analysis – Introduction .....	Page 150
2.	Minimum System Analysis – Cost of Pipe (\$9.05/linear ft.) ....	Page 152
3.	Minimum System Analysis – Construction Cost of Total System	Page 155
4.	Allocation of Capacity Costs – Design Day and Annual Throughput .....	Page 156
C.	General Objections to the Functionalization, Classification and Allocation .....	Page 158
D.	The Use of the Number of Customer Locations in the Cost Allocation Rate Design .....	Page 160
E.	Distribution Plant – Should minimum system analysis be applied to FERC Accounts Nos. 374, 375, 378 & 379 .....	Page 160
F.	FERC Account No. 385. Costs should be directly assigned to industrial customers .....	Page 161
G.	FERC Account Nos. 870, 880, 881, 885, and 894 .....	Page 161
H.	FERC Account Nos. 875, 877, 886, 887, 889, and 887 .....	Page 162
I.	FERC Account Nos. 876 and 890 .....	Page 163
J.	FERC Account No. 904 – Uncollectible Expenses .....	Page 163
K.	FERC Account Nos. 903 & 922 .....	Page 164
L.	FERC Account No. 380 – Services .....	Page 165
M.	FERC Account Nos. 901, 902, and 905 through 916 .....	Page 166
N.	Administrative and General Expenses (FERC Account No.s 920-932) .	Page 167
O.	Allocation of Customer Deposits .....	Page 168
P.	Allocation of Injuries and Damages Reserve .....	Page 168
Q.	Allocation of Rate Base Deductions for Shared Services .....	Page 169
R.	Upstream Pipeline Costs .....	Page 169

S. Overall Cost of Service Allocation ..... Page 171

XVI. Rate Design ..... Page 172

    A. Rate Design ..... Page 172

    B. Revenue Stable Stabilization ..... Page 179

    C. Weather Normalization Adjustment (WNA) ..... Page 182

    D. Uncollectibles ..... Page 184

XVII. CONCLUSION ..... Page 186

Attachments:

PROPOSED ORDER

SCHEDULES