

**RAILROAD COMMISSION OF TEXAS  
HEARINGS DIVISION**

**OIL AND GAS DOCKET NO. 04-0279383**

---

**ENFORCEMENT ACTION AGAINST JOHN FORBES DBA JOHN FORBES OPERATING, A SOLE PROPRIETORSHIP (OPERATOR NO. 275608) FOR VIOLATIONS OF STATEWIDE RULES ON THE KIVLIN, K.J. LEASE, WELL NO. 2 (GAS ID NO. 144450), KINGSVILLE (4260) FIELD, KLEBERG COUNTY, TEXAS**

---

**FINAL ORDER**

The Railroad Commission of Texas ("Commission") finds that after statutory notice the captioned enforcement proceeding was heard by a Commission Administrative Law Judge on November 16, 2017, and that the respondent, Forbes, John Operating, failed to appear or respond to the **Notice of Opportunity for Hearing**. Pursuant to § 1.25 of the Commission's General Rules of Practice and Procedure, 16 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 1.25, and after being duly submitted to the Commission at a conference held in its offices in Austin, Texas, the Commission makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law.

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

1. John Forbes dba John Forbes Operating, a Sole Proprietorship ("Respondent"), Operator No. 275608, was sent the Original Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing by certified and first-class mail, addressed to the most recent Commission Form P-5 (Organization Report) ("Form P-5") address. Respondent's agent as identified on the Form P-5—Tony A. Crutchfield—was sent the Original Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing by certified and first-class mail, addressed to the last known address.
2. The certified mail envelope containing the Original Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing addressed to the Respondent was received on September 1, 2017. The Certified Mail envelope addressed to Tony A. Crutchfield was returned to the Commission unopened on September 11, 2017. The first-class mail envelope addressed to Tony A. Crutchfield was returned to the Commission on September 19, 2017. The first-class mail envelope addressed to Respondent was not returned. Record of the delivery and return of certified mail has been on file with the Commission for more than 15 days, exclusive of the day of receipt and day of issuance. Respondent was given more than 30 days' notice of the Original Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing. Respondent has not entered into an agreed settlement order, filed an answer or requested a hearing.
3. On November 26, 2012, Respondent, a sole proprietorship, filed a Form P-5 with the Commission reporting that its officer consists of the following individual: John Forbes, Owner.

4. John Forbes was in a position of ownership or control of Respondent, as defined in TEX. NAT. RES. CODE § 91.114, during the time period of the violations of Commission rules committed by Respondent.
5. Respondent's Form P-5 is delinquent. Respondent had a \$50,000.00 letter of credit as its financial assurance at the time of the last Form P-5 annual renewal submission.
6. Respondent designated itself to the Commission as the operator of the Kivlin, K.J. Lease, Well No. 2 (Gas ID No. 144450), by filing a Commission Form P-4 (Certificate of Compliance and Transportation Authority), effective August 1, 2011, approved August 26, 2011.
7. A Commission District inspection report made on September 11, 2012, for the Kivlin, K.J. (144450) Lease showed that the sign or identification required by Statewide Rule 3(1), [Tex. R.R. Comm'n, 16 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 3.3(1)], to be posted at the lease entrance was missing. A follow-up inspection made on March 25, 2013, showed that a sign was at the location, but that the sign displayed the incorrect operator name. A later inspection report made on October 17, 2016, showed the sign to again be missing.
8. Commission District inspection reports made on September 15, 2011, July 27, 2012, and September 11, 2012, for the Kivlin, K.J. (144450) Lease, Well No. 2 show that the sign or identification required by Statewide Rule 3(2), [Tex. R.R. Comm'n, 16 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 3.3(2)], to be posted at the well was illegible and displayed the incorrect operator name. Follow-up inspections made on March 25, 2013 and October 17, 2016, showed that the well sign was illegible.
9. The lack of legible signs and identification displaying correct information, as set forth in Statewide Rules 3(1) and 3(2), may cause confusion as to the responsible operator to be contacted and the actual location of a violation or emergency, which can result in delays in remedying a violation or emergency.
10. Commission District inspection reports made on September 15, 2011, July 27, 2012, and March 25, 2013, stated that the tubing pressure and the production casing pressure were equalized. Equalized pressure indicates communication between the tubing and production casing, which is indicative of leaks. Commission records show that Respondent failed to report the change in pressure to the Commission and failed to remedy the leak issue after several letters from the Commission.
11. Leaking wells are likely to cause pollution of usable quality ground water and surface water, as defined in Statewide Rule 8(a)(28) [Tex. R.R. Comm'n, 16 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 3.8(a)(28)]. The failure to report such, as required by Statewide Rule 9(11)(D) to the Commission, deprives the Commission of its ability to ensure that pollution does not occur.
12. Commission records show that the Kivlin, K.J. Lease, Well No. 2 (Gas ID No. 144450), was authorized as a disposal well on June 10, 1999, UIC No. 88963.

Commission inspection reports made on March 25, 2013, and October 17, 2016, and the absence of reported injection since August 2008, showed that the Kivlin, K.J. Lease, Well No. 2 (Gas ID No. 144450), has been inactive for a period greater than one year. Injection into the subject lease ceased on or before September 2008.

13. No workovers, re-entries, or subsequent operations have taken place on the subject well within the last twelve months; the subject well has not been properly plugged in accordance with Statewide Rule 14, 16 TEX. ADMIN CODE § 3.14; and no plugging extensions are in effect for the subject well as allowed by Statewide Rule 14.
14. Usable quality groundwater in the area can become contaminated by migrations or discharges of saltwater and other oil and gas waste from the subject well. Unplugged wellbores, in violation of Statewide Rule 14(b)(2), constitute a cognizable threat to the public health and safety because of the potential of pollution.
15. The total estimated cost to the State for plugging the Kivlin, K.J. Lease, Well No. 2 (Gas ID No. 144450), is \$25,297.00.
16. The Respondent charged with the violations herein recited has no history of violations of Commission rules.

### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

1. Proper notice was issued by the Commission to Respondent and all other appropriate persons legally entitled to notice.
2. All things necessary to the Commission attaining jurisdiction over the subject matter and the parties have been performed or have occurred.
3. Respondent is responsible for maintaining the subject lease in compliance with all applicable Commission rules and TEX. NAT. RES. CODE, chs. 89 and 91.
4. Respondent is in violation of Statewide Rules 3(1), 3(2), 9(11)(D), and 14(b)(2). 16 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §§ 3.3(1), 3.3(2), 3.9(11)(D), and 3.14(b)(2).
5. The documented violations committed by Respondent constitute acts deemed serious, and a hazard to the public health, and demonstrate a lack of good faith pursuant to TEX. NAT. RES. CODE § 81.0531(c).
6. Respondent is responsible for maintaining the subject lease in compliance with Statewide Rule 3(1), which requires that each well site that produces oil, gas, or geothermal resources shall post signs or identification showing the name of the property, name of the operator and the well number.

7. Respondent is responsible for maintaining the subject lease in compliance with Statewide Rule 3(2), which requires that each well site that produces oil, gas, or geothermal resources shall post signs or identification showing the name of the property, name of the operator and the well number.
8. Respondent is responsible for maintaining the subject lease in compliance with Statewide Rule 9(11)(D), which requires operators who engage in disposal operations in porous formations not production of oil, gas or geothermal resources report to the appropriate District Office within 24 hours any significant pressure changes or other monitoring data indicating the presences of leaks in the well.
9. Respondent is responsible for maintaining the subject lease in compliance with Statewide Rule 14(b)(2), which requires that plugging operations on each dry or inactive well shall be commenced within a period of one year after drilling or operations cease and shall proceed with due diligence until completed, unless the operator is eligible for and obtains an extension of the plugging deadline.
10. Pursuant to TEX. NAT. RES. CODE § 81.0531, the Commission may assess administrative penalties against Respondent for the subject violations of up to \$10,000 per day for each violation, with each day such violations continued constituting a separate violation.
11. An assessed administrative penalty in the amount of **TWENTY-SIX THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED SIXTY-FIVE DOLLARS (\$26,965.00)** is justified considering the facts and violations at issue.
12. As a person in a position of ownership or control of Respondent at the time Respondent violated Commission rules related to safety and the control of pollution, John Forbes, and any other organization in which this individual may hold a position of ownership or control, is subject to the restriction in TEX. NAT. RES. CODE § 91.114(a)(2).

### ORDERING PROVISIONS

**IT IS ORDERED THAT** within 30 days from the day immediately following the date this order becomes final:

1. John Forbes dba John Forbes Operating, a Sole Proprietorship (Operator No. 275608) shall place the subject lease and well into compliance with Commission Statewide Rules 3(1), 3(2), 9(11)(D), and 14(b)(2), and all other applicable Commission Statewide Rules, by plugging the subject well in accordance with Statewide Rule 14; and
2. UIC Permit No. 88963 is cancelled; and

3. John Forbes dba John Forbes Operating, a Sole Proprietorship (Operator No. 275608) shall pay to the Railroad Commission of Texas, for disposition as provided by law, an administrative penalty in the amount of **TWENTY-SIX THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED SIXTY-FIVE DOLLARS (\$26,965.00)**.

It is further **ORDERED** that as a person in a position of ownership or control of Respondent at the time Respondent violated Commission rules related to safety and the control of pollution, John Forbes, and any other organization in which this individual may hold a position of ownership or control, **shall be subject to the restriction in TEX. NAT. RES. CODE § 91.114(a)(2) for a period of no more than seven years from the date the order entered in this matter becomes final**, or until the conditions that constituted the violations herein are corrected or are being corrected in accordance with a schedule to which the Commission and the organization have agreed, and all administrative, civil, and criminal penalties and all cleanup and plugging costs incurred by the State relating to those conditions are paid or are being paid in accordance with a schedule to which the Commission and the organization have agreed.

It is further **ORDERED** by the Commission that this order shall not be final and effective until 25 days after the order is signed, unless the time for filing a motion for rehearing has been extended under TEX. GOV'T CODE § 2001.142, by agreement under TEX. GOV'T CODE § 2001.147, or by written Commission order issued pursuant to TEX. GOV'T CODE § 2001.146(e). If a timely motion for rehearing of an application is filed by any party at interest, this order shall not become final and effective until such motion is overruled, or if such motion is granted, this order shall be subject to further action by the Commission. Pursuant to TEX. GOV'T CODE § 2001.146(e), the time allotted for Commission action on a motion for rehearing in this case prior to its being overruled by operation of law is hereby extended until 90 days from the date the Commission order is signed.

All requested findings of fact and conclusions of law, which are not expressly adopted herein, are denied. All pending motions and requests for relief not previously granted or granted herein are denied.

Noncompliance with the provisions of this order is subject to enforcement by the Attorney General and subject to civil penalties of up to \$10,000 per day per violation.

Done this 23<sup>th</sup> day of January 2018.

**RAILROAD COMMISSION OF TEXAS**

(Signatures affixed by Default Master  
Order dated January 23, 2018)

CJH/dac